

THE EFFECT OF COOPERATIVE LEARNING METHOD ON STUDENTS' PERCEPTIONS OF EMPOWERMENT AND THE DEVELOPMENT OF PROFESSIONAL ACCOUNTING COMPETENCIES

Submitted in fulfilment of the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

WAHIDA ZRAA

MA. BSc. (Accounting)

PRINCIPAL SUPERVISOR:

Professor Marie Kavanagh

ASSOCIATE SUPERVISOR:

Dr Melissa Johnson Morgan

School of Accounting, Economics and Finance

Faculty of Business and Law

University of Southern Queensland

Australia

2012

CERTIFICATION OF DISSERTATION

I certify that the ideas, results, analyses, and conclusions reported in this dissertation are entirely my own effort, except where otherwise acknowledged. I also certify that the work is original and has not been previously submitted for any other award, except where otherwise acknowledged.

Signature of Candidate

Date

ENDORSEMENT

Signature of Supervisor/s

Date

Signature of Supervisor/s

Date

DEDICATION

To my father, mother and brothers for their prayers and support;

To my husband, and children: Takwa, Tasnim; and Mohammed

and to all my family and friends

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

In the name of Allah, the Beneficent, the Merciful

All praise is to God. I am extremely grateful for all those who have provided me with their help, encouragement, and assistance in many different ways in order to complete my thesis. I would like to begin with Dr. Todd Hartle; I gratefully acknowledge his help and endless support. He was a supervisor in the proposal stage and a friend during my PhD journey. Without his encouragement and inspiration, this thesis would not have emerged and been completed. Thank you very much for your feedback, suggestions, inspiration, and providing a guiding path through my PhD journey. Professor Marie Kavanagh, thank you for giving me the opportunity to write on this topic. Thank you for your constructive feedback, help, and support through all the years of this study. I would like also to thank my associate supervisor, Dr. Melissa Johnson Morgan, for her guidance and assistance related to research methodology and her consistent open-door approach during the formulation of my thesis. My thanks also go to Liz Watson for all her material and moral support during my PhD journey.

My thanks also go to those who provided me with data or assisted me in data collection, including all Libyan accounting students at Libyan business degree institution. Also, I am indebted to Dr. Asma Taleb, Dr. Mohammed Matoak and Dr. Keath Elnowre. Thank you for your support and help in data collection.

I am also very grateful to all those people who helped me and provided me with their constructive feedback, ideas and support: Prof. Shulman, thank you for your time and

giving me permission to use the Learning Empowerment Scale ‘survey’. It is a great honour to have you respond to my inquiries.

Finally, I would like also to thank all my lecturers and friends at the University of Southern Queensland (USQ). My office-mate Sophia Imran, for her friendship and for provision of constructive feedback on my English language use and my thesis; Chris O’Reilly, for her help, support, and feedback on writing my PhD. Thanks also go to Kellie grant for her friendship and assistance related to my English language development and usage. Special thanks to Dr. Lucas Van Der Laan for his help and endless support during my proposal journey.

All those I have mentioned above, your assistance and support are highly valued. My thanks also extend to those not mentioned above who have, in many unique ways, been of great support and assistance.

ABSTRACT

The purpose of this exploratory study is to compare a cooperative learning environment with a traditional educational environment within Libyan business degree institution and how this affects students' perceptions of empowerment and development of professional accounting competencies in a first year accounting course (Accounting Principles I). The research also investigates the relationship of empowerment with the development of professional accounting competencies and classroom instruction. This study involved quantitative and qualitative data from a survey of 288 students who were studying in their first year in Accounting Principles I; and pre and post written exams, and reflections were conducted. Quantitative data were analysed using reliability tests, factor analysis, t-tests and correlations. Qualitative data were analysed by hand coding. The results indicate that students who attended cooperative learning classes are more empowered than students who attended traditional classes. In addition, the results reveal that students' perceptions of empowerment and development of the professional accounting competencies were influenced by classroom instruction methods.

PUBLICATIONS ARISING FROM THIS DISSERTATION

Publications in conferences

Zraa, W, Kavanagh, M & Hartle, T 2011, 'Teaching accounting in the new millennium', paper presented to Cambridge Business & Economics Conference (CBEC), Cambridge June 27-28.

Zraa, W, Kavanagh, M & Hartle, T 2011, 'Adopting appropriate Teaching Models to develop knowledge and skills to academic standards in the accounting discipline', paper presented to Accounting and Finance Association of Australia and New Zealand (AFAANZ), Darwin.

Zraa, W, Imran, S, Kavanagh, M & Johnson Morgan, M 2011, 'The relationships between students' empowerment, students' performance, accounting course perceptions and classroom instruction in accounting', paper presented to 15th International Business Research Conference, Sydney, 21-23 Nov.

Zraa, W, Kavanagh, M & Johnson Morgan, M 2012, 'The effects of cooperative learning on students' perceptions of empowerment in accounting course', paper presented to 16th International Business Research Conference, Dubai, UAE, 12-13 April 2012.

Zraa, W, Kavanagh, M & Johnson Morgan, M 2012, 'A comparison study of Libyan and Australian accounting students in their perceptions of empowerment ', paper presented to Accounting and Finance Association of Australia and New Zealand (AFAANZ), Melbourne, Australia.

Zraa, W, Kavanagh, M & Johnson Morgan, M 2012, 'The effects of cooperative learning on students' empowerment and professional accounting competencies in introductory accounting course', paper presented to 7th Annual London Business Research Conference London, UK.

Publications in journals

Zraa, W, Kavanagh, M & Johnson Morgan, M 2012, A comparison of Libyan and Australian students' perceptions of empowerment in accounting courses, *Journal of Modern Accounting and Auditing*, vol. 8, No. 11.

Zraa, W, Kavanagh, M & Johnson Morgan, M 2013, The Impact of Cooperative Learning and Empowerment on the Performance of First-Year Accounting Students, *Journal of Modern Accounting and Auditing*, vol. 9, No. 2.

Table of Contents

CERTIFICATION OF DISSERTATION.....	I
DEDICATION	II
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	III
ABSTRACT	V
PUBLICATIONS ARISING FROM THIS DISSERTATION	VI
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	2
1.1 INTRODUCTION	2
1.2 BACKGROUND OF THE RESEARCH AND LITERATURE REVIEW	4
1.2.1 Skills needed by accounting professionals	4
1.2.2 Accounting education challenges	10
1.2.3 Empowerment	15
1.3 RESEARCH PROBLEM AND RESEARCH QUESTION	19
1.4 RESEARCH OBJECTIVES	21
1.5 MOTIVATION FOR THE STUDY	22
1.6 THE RESEARCH CONTEXT	23
1.6.1 Overview of Libya	23
1.6.2 Demographic and economic information on Libya	24
1.6.3 Overview of teaching and learning accounting in Libya	29
1.7 RESEARCH CONTRIBUTIONS	34
1.8 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	36
1.9 CLASSIFICATION OF RESEARCH DESIGN	37
1.10 LIMITATION OF SCOPE	37
1.11 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS	38
1.12 THE THESIS STRUCTURE	39
1.13 CONCLUSION	40
CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW	43
2.1 INTRODUCTION	43
2.2 CHOOSING AN APPROPRIATE METHOD TO TEACH FUTURE ACCOUNTANTS	45
2.2.1 Teaching method criteria	45
2.2.2 Teaching methods and related learning theories	47
2.2.3 The application of the professional accounting competencies criteria to the various theoretical families and learning theory	56
2.3 COOPERATIVE LEARNING METHOD	61
2.3.1 Elements of cooperative learning method	62
2.3.2 Types of cooperative learning method	67
2.4 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK	70
2.5 CONCLUSION	75
CHAPTER THREE: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	78
3.1 INTRODUCTION	78
3.2 PILOT STUDY	78
3.2.1 The objective of the pilot study	79
3.2.2 Pilot study question and hypotheses	80

3.2.3 Pilot study setting	81
3.2.4 Pilot study participants	81
3.2.5 Data collection	82
3.3 MAIN STUDY	82
3.3.1 Research Design (Quasi-experimental design)	82
3.3.2 Data collection	85
3.3.3 Course Design	93
3.3.4 Data Analysis and Interpretation	99
3.3.5 Conclusion	103
CHAPTER FOUR: QUANTITATIVE ANALYSIS	106
4.1 INTRODUCTION	106
4.2 RESULTS FOR PILOT STUDY	106
4.2.1 Response rate, cleaning and screening data	106
4.2.2 Missing data	107
4.2.3 Normality	107
4.2.4 Respondents' profiles	108
4.2.5 Reliability and Factor analysis	110
4.2.6 Hypothesis testing	112
4.2.7 Conclusion	118
4.3 RESULTS FOR THE MAIN STUDY	119
4.3.1 Response rate	119
4.3.2 Cleaning, Normality, and Missing data	119
4.3.3 Respondents' profiles	120
4.3.4 Reliability and factor analysis	123
4.3.5 Hypothesis testing	131
4.3.6 Conclusions	154
CHAPTER FIVE: QUALITATIVE ANALYSIS	157
5.1 INTRODUCTIONS	157
5.2 TEACHING ISSUES	158
5.2.1 Students' perceptions of empowerment	159
5.2.2 Culture	164
5.2.3 Resistance	166
5.3 LEARNING ISSUES	172
5.3.1 Students' perceptions of empowerment	173
5.3.2 Development of students' professional accounting competencies	179
5.3.3 Understanding	181
5.4 CONCLUSION	185
CHAPTER SIX: DISCUSSION	189
6.1 INTRODUCTION	189
6.2 DISCUSSION OF MAJOR FINDINGS	191
6.2.1 The students' perceptions of empowerment	191
6.2.2 The development of professional accounting competencies	200
6.2.3 The relationship between students' perceptions of empowerment and the development of professional accounting competencies	208
6.3. CONCLUSION	212
CHAPTER SEVEN: CONCLUSIONS	215

7.1 INTRODUCTION.....	215
7.2 SUMMARY OF RESEARCH FINDINGS	216
7.3 RESEARCH IMPLICATIONS AND CONTRIBUTION.....	220
7.3.1 <i>Implications and Contributions for Research</i>	220
7.3.2 <i>Implications and Contributions for Practice</i>	222
7.4 LIMITATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	224
7.5 SUGGESTIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH.....	225
7.6 CONCLUSION.....	227
REFERENCES	229
APPENDICES	242

LIST OF TABLES

TABLE 2.1 SOCIAL FAMILY MODELS.....	51
TABLE 2.2: GUIDELINES FOR INSTRUCTORS IMPLEMENTING COOPERATIVE LEARNING METHOD	67
TABLE 3.1: COURSE DESIGN AND DATA COLLECTION	94
TABLE 3.2: DIFFERENCES BETWEEN COOPERATIVE LEARNING AND TRADITIONAL TEACHING METHODS	97
TABLE 3.3: THE CRITERIA USED FOR FACTOR ANALYSIS FOR LEARNER EMPOWERMENT SCALE	100
TABLE: 4.1: SURVEYS DISTRIBUTED AND RECEIVED	106
TABLE 4.2: FREQUENCIES OF RESPONDENTS' GENDER AND AGE	109
TABLE 4.3: FREQUENCIES OF RESPONDENTS' MAJOR AND GRADE POINT AVERAGE.....	109
TABLE 4.4: THE RELIABILITY OF THE LEARNER EMPOWERMENT SCALE	110
TABLE 4.5: THE RELIABILITY OF THE COURSE PERCEPTIONS' SCALE.....	111
TABLE 4.6 EMPOWERMENT FACTOR ANALYSIS FOR LIBYAN AND AUSTRALIAN RESPONSES	112
TABLE 4.7: SUMMARY OF T-TEST FOR H1	113
TABLE 4.8: THE CORRELATIONS BETWEEN STUDENTS' PERCEPTIONS OF EMPOWERMENT, PERCEPTIONS OF THE COURSE, AND STUDENTS' ACADEMIC PERFORMANCE FOR BOTH GROUPS	115
TABLE 4.9: THE CORRELATIONS BETWEEN STUDENTS' PERCEPTIONS OF EMPOWERMENT, AND PERCEPTIONS OF THE COURSE FOR AUSTRALIAN RESPONSES.....	115
TABLE 4.10: THE CORRELATIONS BETWEEN STUDENTS' PERCEPTIONS OF EMPOWERMENT, AND PERCEPTIONS OF THE COURSE FOR LIBYAN RESPONSES	116
TABLE 4.11: SUMMARY OF T-TEST FOR H3	117
TABLE 4.12: THE SURVEYS DISTRIBUTED AND RECEIVED	119
TABLE 4.13: FREQUENCIES OF RESPONSES' GENDER AND AGE	121
TABLE 4.14: FREQUENCIES OF RESPONDENTS' MAJOR AND GRADE POINT AVERAGE.....	122
TABLE 4.15: FREQUENCIES OF RESPONSES FOR MAJOR AND PREVIOUS CERTIFICATE.....	123
TABLE 4.16: THE RELIABILITY OF THE LEARNER EMPOWERMENT SCALE	125

TABLE 4.17: PROFESSIONAL ACCOUNTING COMPETENCIES BASED ON PRE RESPONSES.....	126
TABLE 4.18 LEARNER EMPOWERMENT SCALE FACTOR ANALYSIS FOR BASED ON PRE RESPONSES	128
TABLE 4.19 LEARNER EMPOWERMENT SCALE FACTOR ANALYSIS FOR BASED ON POST RESPONSES	129
TABLE 4.20: PROFESSIONAL ACCOUNTING COMPETENCIES FACTOR ANALYSIS BASED ON POST RESPONSES FOR LIBYAN STUDENTS	130
TABLE: 4. 21: SUMMARY OF T-TEST FOR H1 BASED ON PRE RESPONSES	133
TABLE: 4. 22: SUMMARY OF T-TEST FOR H1 BASED ON POST RESPONSES	135
TABLE: 4. 23: SUMMARY OF INDEPENDENT T-TEST FOR H1 BASED ON PRE AND POST LEARNER EMPOWERMENT SCALE'S RESPONSES IN TRADITIONAL TEACHING METHOD'S GROUP	136
TABLE: 4. 24: SUMMARY OF PAIRED SAMPLE T-TEST FOR H1 BASED ON PRE AND POST LEARNER EMPOWERMENT SCALE'S RESPONSES IN TRADITIONAL TEACHING METHOD'S GROUP	137
TABLE: 4. 25: SUMMARY OF INDEPENDENT T-TEST FOR H1 BASED ON PRE AND POST LEARNER EMPOWERMENT SCALE RESPONSES IN COOPERATIVE LEARNING'S GROUP	138
TABLE: 4. 26: SUMMARY OF A PAIRED-SAMPLES T-TEST FOR H1 BASED ON PRE AND POST LEARNER EMPOWERMENT SCALE'S RESPONSES IN COOPERATIVE LEARNING'S GROUP	138
TABLE: 4.27: SUMMARY OF T-TEST FOR H2	140
TABLE 4.28: SUMMARY OF T-TEST FOR H3 BASED ON PRE WRITTEN EXAM 1	142
TABLE 4.29: SUMMARY OF T-TEST FOR H3 BASED ON POST WRITTEN EXAM 1.....	143
TABLE 4.30: SUMMARY OF T-TEST FOR H3 BASED ON PRE AND POST WRITTEN EXAM 1 FOR TRADITIONAL TEACHING METHOD'S GROUP	144
TABLE 4.31: SUMMARY OF PAIRED SAMPLE T-TEST FOR H3 BASED ON PRE AND POST WRITTEN EXAM 1 FOR TRADITIONAL TEACHING METHOD'S GROUP	145
TABLE 4.32: SUMMARY OF T-TEST FOR H3 BASED ON PRE AND POST WRITTEN EXAM 1 FOR COOPERATIVE LEARNING METHOD'S GROUP	146
TABLE 4.33: SUMMARY OF PAIRED SAMPLE T-TEST FOR H3 BASED ON PRE AND POST WRITTEN EXAM 1 FOR COOPERATIVE LEARNING METHOD'S GROUP	147
TABLE 4.34: SUMMARY OF T-TEST FOR H3 BASED ON PRE WRITTEN EXAM 2	148
TABLE 4.35: SUMMARY OF T-TEST FOR H3 BASED ON POST WRITTEN EXAM 2.....	149
TABLE 4.36: SUMMARY OF T-TEST FOR H3 BASED ON PRE POST WRITTEN EXAM 2 FOR TRADITIONAL TEACHING METHOD'S GROUP	150
TABLE 4.37: SUMMARY OF PAIRED SAMPLE T-TEST FOR H ₃ BASED ON PRE POST WRITTEN EXAM 2 FOR TRADITIONAL TEACHING METHOD'S GROUP	151
TABLE 4.38: SUMMARY OF T-TEST FOR H ₃ BASED ON PRE POST WRITTEN EXAM 2 FOR COOPERATIVE LEARNING METHOD'S GROUP	152
TABLE 4.39: SUMMARY OF PAIRED SAMPLE T-TEST FOR H3 BASED ON PRE POST WRITTEN EXAM 2 FOR COOPERATIVE LEARNING METHOD'S GROUP	152
TABLE 4.40: THE CORRELATIONS BETWEEN PROFESSIONAL ACCOUNTING COMPETENCIES (PAC) (BASED ON STUDENTS' PERCEPTIONS AND WRITTEN EXAM), AND STUDENTS' PERCEPTIONS OF EMPOWERMENT (LES).....	154
TABLE 4.41: HYPOTHESES AND CONCLUSIONS	155

LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURE 2.1: VISUAL STRUCTURE OF CHAPTER 2.....	44
FIGURE 2.2: THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK DEVELOPED FOR THIS STUDY	74
FIGURE 3.1: INDEPENDENT VARIABLE AND DEPENDENT VARIABLES	101
FIGURE 5.1: MAJOR THEMES FROM QUALITATIVE DATA	158
FIGURE 5.2: TEACHING ISSUES.....	159

LIST OF APPENDICES

APPENDIX A: SAMPLE LESSON PLAN FOR ACCOUNTING I USING COOPERATIVE LEARNING.....	243
APPENDIX B: SAMPLE LESSON PLAN FOR ACCOUNTING I USING TRADITIONAL METHOD.....	252
APPENDIX C: PRE SURVEY FOR STUDENTS ENROLLED IN ACCOUNTING PRINCIPLE I AT LIBYAN BUSINESS DEGREE INSTITUTION	256
APPENDIX D: POST SURVEY FOR STUDENTS ENROLLED IN ACCOUNTING PRINCIPLE I AT LIBYAN BUSINESS DEGREE INSTITUTION	259
APPENDIX E: POST WRITTEN EXAMS FOR ACCOUNTING PRINCIPLE I ENGLISH VERSION AND ARABIC VERSION	262
APPENDIX F: PERMISSION TO USE THE INSTRUMENT	270
APPENDIX G: ETHICAL CLEARANCE	272